



Central Pollution Control Board

(Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change)

Parivesh Bhawan, East Arjun Nagar,

Delhi - 110032

Minutes of Second meeting of Joint Committee held on 23.6.2020 under the Chairmanship of Dr.D.P.Mathuria, ED (Technical), NMCG through *Video Conferencing* for ensuring compliance to Hon'ble National Green Tribunal (NGT), PB, Delhi Order dated 05.03.2020 in OA No. 06 of 2012 in the matter of Manoj Mishra Vs Union of India (UOI) & Ors.

Second meeting of the Joint Committee (JC) was held on 23.06.2020 at 04.00 PM through Video Conferencing under the Chairmanship of Mr.D.P.Mathuria, ED (Technical), National Mission for Clean Ganga (NMCG) with the officials of Delhi Pollution Control Committee (DPCC), Haryana State Pollution Control Board (HSPCB) & U.P. Pollution Control Board (UPPCB). List of participants is given at **Annexure-I**.

Sh A. Sudhakar, DH, WQM-I welcomed Mr.D.P.Mathuria, ED (Technical), NMCG and all other members of the Joint Committee viz. Prof.A.K.Nema, IIT, Delhi, Dr.Anupma Sharma, NIH, Roorkee, Prof. A.A. Kazmi, IIT, Roorkee and Er. Hemant Bherwani, Scientist, NEERI as well as the officials of three States (viz., UP, Delhi and Haryana) & CPCB.

Mr D.P Mathuria, ED (Technical) NMCG, enquired from CPCB about the status of receipt of information from the three States viz Delhi, Haryana and Uttar Pradesh as per the template circulated by CPCB. Thereafter, Sh. J.C Babu, AD, WQM-I Division outlined the proposed agenda of the meeting and informed to the Joint Committee that minutes of first meeting of the Joint Committee along with a template was circulated to all the three States vide CPCB letter dated 13.5.2020 with a request to submit the desired information within a week time. As no response was received from the States, a reminder was sent to the three States for providing only compiled information as per the template vide CPCB letter dated 11.6.2020. He also apprised to the Committee that departmental information has been received from Irrigation & Flood Control Department, Delhi Jal Board (DJB) (but not as per template), Delhi Cantonment Board in the specified template. However, information from Haryana (except GMDA, HSIIDC Departments, Haryana-but not as per the template) and Uttar Pradesh States are still awaited.

Sh. D.K Singh, SEE, DPCC apprised Joint Committee that the Urban Development Department, Delhi is co-ordinating with the concerned departments and compiling the information on behalf of Delhi. He also informed that as many departments are involved in Delhi State, compilation of desired information is a big task and require more time.

Shri J.P. Singh, SEE , Haryana SPCB informed that information is under compilation and shall submitted as per the template within 2-3days.

Sh. Ashok Tiwari, CEO, UPPCB apprised that information in the template is under compilation and shall be submitted within a week time.

Sh.D.P. Mathuria also requested all the members of the Joint Committee to extend their views on non-submission of the information and further course of action for assessment of damage as directed by Hon'ble NGT. The unexpected delay by the three States would delay the process of compliance of Hon'ble NGT directions w.r.t assessment of environmental damages.

Dr.Anupma Sharma, Scientist 'F', NIH, Roorkee also put forth her view that assessment of environmental damage in monetary terms could be done by preparing matrix including parameters such as human health, abiotic stock resources, cultural and recreational values, ecosystem production capacity and ecological services provided by the riverine system to both the humans and aquatic life. The level of pollutant discharges into water body as well as its reduction over the time can also be considered as one of the option for assessment of environmental damages.

Prof A.K.Nema , IIT Delhi opined that an interim reply may be filed with Hon'ble NGT seeking additional time for ensuring compliance to the Hon'ble NGT directions.

Shri A.Sudhakar, DH, WQM-I proposed that the States are likely to take more time to submit the compiled information as per template circulated by CPCB. Meanwhile, an interim report be submitted to Hon'ble NGT and additional time of four months beyond 30th June 2020 may be sought to submit the Committees report. Further, a sub-group may be formed to interact more frequently and prepare a methodology & identify available data to utilise for the purpose. He opined that any new study to generate data may take long time for finalisation of the reports. Based on the recommendations of the sub-group, Joint Committee may arrive at the assessment of damages to the environment in monetary terms.

Dr.D.P.Mathuria, appreciated the suggestions of all the members of the Joint Committee and considering the suggestions made by the members of *Joint Committee, following decisions were made: -*

- (a) *State Regulators from Haryana, Delhi & U.P (to act as Nodal departments) shall provide compiled information as per template circulated by CPCB within a week i.e., by 30.06.2020. In case of failure to comply the issue may be apprised to Chief Secretary's of concerned States indicating delay on part of Nodal Departments in parting with requisite information.*
- (b) *Large amount of data on upper Yamuna riverine ecosystem, hydrology, ground water hydrology and water quality is available with NIH as part of recent study carried by them for National Mission for Clean Ganga towards assessment of e-flows from Hathnikund to Okhla reach of Yamuna including similar data for various drains outfalling into Yamuna. Accordingly, this data may be utilised, pending receipt of requisite data from States for taking up study immediately. For this purpose, it was agreed that Dr Anupma Sharma, Sc-'F',*

NIH, Roorkee shall make a presentation on methodology to be adopted for assessing environmental damage on 25.06.2020 through VC.

- (c) An Interim reply may be submitted to Hon'ble NGT in OA No. 6 of 2012 seeking additional time of four months beyond 30th June 2020 for assessment of damages to the environment in view of non-compliances by the concerned for rejuvenation of river Yamuna and also to submit recommendations of the Joint Committee before Hon'ble NGT.*
- (d) A sub-group comprising IIT, Delhi, NIH, Roorkee and NEERI may finalise the methodology for assessment of environmental damage in monetary terms and thereafter, Joint Committee may finalise its recommendations on the subject and filed its report in compliance to Hon'ble NGT.*

The meeting ended with thanks to the Chair.

-- OO --

Annexure-I

List of Participants attended the Second meeting of Joint Committee held on 23.06.2020 at 4.00 PM onwards through Video Conferencing for ensuring compliance to Hon'ble NGT order dated 5.3.2020 in O.A NO 06/2012 in the matter of Manoj Mishra Vs UoI & Oths.

S No	Name of Officials attended the meeting through VC	Designation	Phone No	E mail id
1	Sh D.P Mathuria	ED Technical NMCG	9911725111	uyrb-mowr@nic.in
2	Sh A Sudhakar	DH-WQM-I, CPCB	8800326699	asudhakar.cpcb@nic.in
3	Sh A.K. Nema	Professor, Deptt of Civil Engg, IIT Delhi	9810827852	aknema@civil.iitd.ac.in
4	Dr Anupama Sharma	Scientist-'F',NIH, Roorkee	9897919552	anupma.nihr@nic.in
5	Prof.A.A Kazmi	IIT, Roorkee	9837262698	absar.kazmi@ce.iitr.ac.in
6	Er. Hemant Bherwani	Scientist, NEERI, Nagpur	9096049515	h.bherwani@neeri.res.in
7	Sh J. Chandra Babu	Sc E, WQM-I Div, CPCB	9868278903	jcb.cpcb@nic.in
8	Sh J.P Singh	SEE, HSPCB	9216849307	
9	Sh D.K Singh	SEE, DPCC, Delhi	9717593512	
10	Sh. Ashok Kumar Tiwari	CEO, UPPCB	9412168902	
11	Mrs.Suniti Parashar	Sc C, WQM-I Div, CPCB	9868819711	suniti.cpcb@nic.in